

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

In the Name of Allāh the Most Merciful the Most Beneficent

Question: Is the mere obedience to a created being in disobedience – which is lesser than *shirk* and *kufr* – towards The Creator *shirk*, or is the belief in the validity or allowance or forbidding of the deed a necessity in order for it to be *shirk*?

Answer: Whoever obeys a created being in sins which are lesser than *shirk* and *kufr*, then his *hukm* (judgment) is that he is a sinner which have gone against the words of the Prophet (sallAllāhu alayhi wa sallam) when he said:

لا طَاعَةَ لِمَخْلُوقٍ فِي مَعْصِيَةِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ

“There is no obedience to a created being in the disobedience towards Allāh the Mighty and Majestic.” (Narrated by Imām Ahmad in a *sahīh hadīth*)

In order for this sin to become a *shirk* the it necessitated that the person believes in the validity of the command which he has been given – so he believes that someone has the right to legislate other than Allāh – or he believes in the allowance of what Allāh has forbidden or the forbiddance of what Allāh has allowed. In this case the deed becomes major *shirk* which takes the person out of the fold of Islām.

Among the evidence for this is the following:

Allāh – the Exalted – said:

وَلَا تَأْكُلُوا مِمَّا لَمْ يُذْكَرِ اسْمُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهِ وَإِنَّهُ لَفِسْقٌ وَإِنَّ الشَّيَاطِينَ لَيُوحُونَ إِلَىٰ أَوْلِيَائِهِمْ لِيُجَادِلُوكُمْ وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ إِنَّكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ

“And do not eat of that upon which the name of Allāh has not been mentioned, for indeed, it is grave disobedience. And indeed do the devils inspire their allies (among mankind) to dispute with you. And if you were to obey them, indeed, you would be *mushrikūn*.” (Al-An’ām 6:121)

Al-Imām Ibn Jarīr At-Tabarī – rahimahullāh – said in his *tafsīr* of the verse:

وَأَمَّا قَوْلُهُ : وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ إِنْكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ ، فَإِنَّهُ يَعْنِي : وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ فِي أَكْلِ الْمَيْتَةِ وَمَا حَرَّمَ عَلَيْكُمْ رَبُّكُمْ; كَمَا - :
 13833 - حَدَّثَنِي الْمُتَنِّي قَالَ : حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ صَالِحٍ قَالَ : حَدَّثَنَا مُعَاوِيَةُ ، عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ أَبِي طَلْحَةَ ، عَنْ ابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ (: وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ) ، يَقُولُ : وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ فِي أَكْلِ مَا هَيَّبْتُمْ عَنْهُ .
 13834 - حَدَّثَنِي مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ قَالَ : حَدَّثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُقْضَلٍ قَالَ : حَدَّثَنَا أَسْبَاطُ ، عَنِ السُّدِّيِّ (: وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ) ، فَأَكَلْتُمُ الْمَيْتَةَ .

وَأَمَّا قَوْلُهُ : (إِنْكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ) ، يَعْنِي : إِنْكُمْ إِذَا مَثَلْتُمْ ، إِذْ كَانَ هَؤُلَاءِ يَأْكُلُونَ الْمَيْتَةَ اسْتِحْلَالًا . فَإِذَا أَنْتُمْ أَكَلْتُمُوهَا كَذَلِكَ ، فَقَدْ صِرْتُمْ مِثْلَهُمْ مُشْرِكِينَ .

“Regarding His words: “And if you were to obey them, indeed, you would be mushrikūn.” Then it verily means: And if you were to obey them in eating the self-dead animal and what your Lord has forbidden for you, just as:

- 13883: Al-Muthannā narrated to me and said: Abdullāh ibn Sālih narrated to us and said: Mu’āwiyah narrated to us, from Alī ibn Abī Talhah, from Ibn Abbās: **“And if you were to obey them.”** He (Allāh) says: And if you were to obey them in eating that which you have been forbidden from.

- 13834 Muhammad ibn Al-Husāin narrated to us and said: Ahmad ibn Mufaddal narrated to us and said: Asbāt narrated to us, from As-Suddī: **“And if you were to obey them”**, and you ate the self-dead.

Regarding His words: “Indeed, you would be mushrikūn.” This means: Then you would be like them. Since these people eat the self-dead animal while allowing it (istihlālan). So if you also eat it likewise, then you have verily become like them.”

(Tafsīr At-Tabarī – Sūrah Al-An’ām)

Al-Qurtubī said in his *tafsīr* of the verse:

الْحَامِسَةُ قَوْلُهُ تَعَالَى : وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ أَيُّ فِي تَحْلِيلِ الْمَيْتَةِ إِنْكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ فَذَلَّتِ الْآيَةُ عَلَى أَنَّ مِنْ اسْتِحْلَالِ شَيْئًا مِمَّا حَرَّمَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى صَارَ بِهِ مُشْرِكًا . وَقَدْ حَرَّمَ اللَّهُ سُبْحَانَهُ الْمَيْتَةَ نَصًّا ; فَإِذَا قَبِلَ تَحْلِيلَهَا مِنْ غَيْرِهِ فَقَدْ أَشْرَكَ . قَالَ ابْنُ الْعَرَبِيِّ : إِنَّمَا يَكُونُ الْمُؤْمِنُ بِطَاعَةِ الْمُشْرِكِ مُشْرِكًا إِذَا أَطَاعَهُ فِي الْإِعْتِقَادِ ; فَأَمَّا إِذَا أَطَاعَهُ فِي الْفِعْلِ وَعَقْدُهُ سَلِيمٌ مُسْتَمِرٌّ عَلَى التَّوْحِيدِ وَالتَّصَدِيقِ فَهُوَ غَاصٍ ; فَافْتَهُوهُ . وَقَدْ مَضَى فِي الْمَائِدَةِ

“The fifth (issue in this verse) is His – the Exalted – Words: **“And if you were to obey them”**, which means: in *tahlil* (allowing) the self-dead, **“indeed, you would be mushrikūn.”** So the verse proves that whoever allows something which Allah – the Exalted – has forbidden, he becomes a mushrik by this. And verily did Allah – Praised is He – forbid the self-dead with a text (in the Qurān). So if he accepts the allowance of it from other than Him, then he has verily committed *shirk*. Ibn Al-‘Arabī said: Verily does the believer become mushrik by obeying a mushrik, if he obeys him in the belief. But if he only obeys him in the deed while his belief is still correct (regarding the hukm of that deed) and he remains upon *Tawhīd* and Belief, then he is sinning. So understand this! And this has already gone forth in (the *tafsīr* of Surah) Al-Māidah.”

(Tafsīr Al-Qurtubī – Sūrah Al-An‘ām)

Ibn Kathīr – rahimahullāh – said in his *tafsīr* of the verse:

وَقَالَ السُّدِّيُّ فِي تَفْسِيرِ هَذِهِ الْآيَةِ : إِنَّ الْمُشْرِكِينَ قَالُوا لِلْمُؤْمِنِينَ : كَيْفَ تَزْعُمُونَ أَنْكُمْ تَتَّبِعُونَ مَرْضَاةَ اللَّهِ ، وَمَا دَبَّحَ اللَّهُ فَلَا تَأْكُلُونَهُ ، وَمَا دَبَّحْتُمْ أَنْتُمْ أَكَلْتُمُوهُ؟ فَقَالَ اللَّهُ : وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ (فَأَكَلْتُمْ الْمَيْتَةَ) إِنْكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ . وَهَكَذَا قَالَهُ مُجَاهِدٌ ، وَالضَّحَّاكُ ، وَعَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ أَبِي عُثْمَانَ ، وَغَيْرُ وَاحِدٍ مِنْ عُلَمَاءِ السَّلَفِ ، رَحِمَهُمُ اللَّهُ .

وَقَوْلُهُ تَعَالَى : وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ إِنْكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ أَيُّ : حَيْثُ عَدَلْتُمْ عَنْ أَمْرِ اللَّهِ لَكُمْ وَشَرَعِهِ إِلَى قَوْلِ غَيْرِهِ ، فَقَدَّمْتُمْ عَلَيْهِ غَيْرَهُ فَهَذَا هُوَ الشِّرْكُ ، كَمَا قَالَ تَعَالَى :

“And As-Suddī said in the *tafsīr* of this verse: Verily did the mushrikūn say to the believers: How do you claim to seek the pleasure of Allah, while that which Allah has slaughtered you do not eat, but that which you slaughtered yourselves you eat? So Allah said: **“And if you were to obey them”**, so you ate the self-dead, **“indeed, you would be mushrikūn.”** And likewise said Mujāhid, Ad-Dahhāk and more than one from the scholars of the *salaf* – may Allah have mercy upon them.

And His – the Exalted – Words: **“And if you were to obey them, indeed, you would be mushrikūn.”** This means: When you turned from the command of Allah upon you and His Law, to the opinion of others than Him, so you preferred others over Him, then this is the *shirk*, just as He – the Exalted – said:

اتَّخَذُوا أَحْبَابَهُمْ وَرُهْبَانَهُمْ أَرْبَابًا مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ وَالْمَسِيحَ ابْنَ مَرْيَمَ وَمَا أُمِرُوا إِلَّا لِيَعْبُدُوا إِلَهًا وَاحِدًا لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا هُوَ
 سُبْحَانَهُ عَمَّا يُشْرِكُونَ

“They have taken their scholars and monks as lords besides Allah, and (also) Al-Masīh, the son of Maryam. And they were not commanded except to worship one *ilāh* (deity).

There is no no-one worthy of worship except Him. Exalted is He above whatever they associate with Him.” (At-Tawbah 9:31)

وَقَدْ رَوَى التِّرْمِذِيُّ فِي تَفْسِيرِهَا ، عَنْ عَبْدِ بْنِ حَاتِمٍ أَنَّهُ قَالَ : يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ، مَا عَبَدُوهُمْ ، فَقَالَ : " بَلَّ إِثْمُ أَحْلُوا لَهُمُ الْحَرَامَ وَحَرَّمُوا عَلَيْهِمُ الْحَلَالَ ، فَاتَّبَعُوهُمْ ، فَذَلِكَ عِبَادَتُهُمْ إِيَّاهُمْ "

And verily did At-Tirmidhī narrated in the tafsīr of it (i.e. the verse), from ‘Adī ibn Hātim that he said: ‘O Messenger of Allah, they did not worship them’, so he (sallAllāhu alayhi wa sallam) said: ‘Yes, they verily allowed the forbidden for them, and they forbade the allowed for them, and they followed them (in this). So this is their worship of them.’”

(Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr – Sūrah Al-An’ām)

Al-Baghawī – rahimahullāh – said in his tafsīr of the verse:

قَوْلُهُ تَعَالَى : وَإِنَّ الشَّيَاطِينَ لَبُوحُونَ إِلَى أَوْلِيَائِهِمْ لِيُجَادِلُوكُمْ أَرَادَ أَنَّ الشَّيَاطِينَ لَيُوسِسُونَ إِلَى أَوْلِيَائِهِمْ مِنَ الْمُشْرِكِينَ لِيُجَادِلُوكُمْ ، وَذَلِكَ أَنَّ الْمُشْرِكِينَ قَالُوا : يَا مُحَمَّدُ أَخْبِرْنَا عَنِ الشَّاةِ إِذَا مَاتَتْ مَنْ قَتَلَهَا؟ فَقَالَ : اللَّهُ قَتَلَهَا ، قَالُوا : أَفَتَرَعُمُ أَنَّ مَا قَتَلَتْ أَنْتَ وَأَصْحَابُكَ حَلَالَ ، وَمَا قَتَلَهُ الْكَلْبُ وَالصَّغُرُ حَلَالَ ، وَمَا قَتَلَهُ اللَّهُ حَرَامًا؟ فَأَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ هَذِهِ الْآيَةَ ، وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ فِي أَكْلِ الْمَيْتَةِ ، إِنَّكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ قَالَ الرَّجُلُ : وَفِيهِ دَلِيلٌ عَلَى أَنَّ مَنْ أَحَلَّ شَيْئًا مِمَّا حَرَّمَ اللَّهُ أَوْ حَرَّمَ مَا أَحَلَّ اللَّهُ فَهُوَ مُشْرِكٌ .

“His – the Exalted – Words: “And indeed do the devils inspire their allies (among mankind) to dispute with you.” He wanted (to declare) that the shayātīn whispers to their allies from the mushrikūn, so they may argue with you. And this is that the mushrikūn said: O Muhammad, inform us about the sheep when it dies who killed it? So he said: Allah killed it. So they said: So you claim that what you have killed, you and your companions, is allowed (to eat), and what the dog and the hawk has killed is allowed, but what Allah has killed is forbidden? So Allah revealed this verse: “And if you were to obey them,” i.e. in eating the self-dead, “indeed, you would be mushrikūn.” Az-Zajjāj said: And in it (i.e. the verse) there is evidence for that whoever allows something from that which Allah has forbidden, or forbids that which Allah has allowed, then he is mushrik.”

(Tafsīr Al-Baghawī – Sūrah Al-An’ām)

As-Sa’dī – rahimahullāh – said in his tafsīr of the verse:

فَإِنَّ الْمُشْرِكِينَ – حِينَ سَمِعُوا تَحْرِيمَ اللَّهِ وَرَسُولِهِ الْمَيْتَةَ، وَتَحْلِيلَهُ لِمَذَكَاةٍ، وَكَانُوا يَسْتَحِلُّونَ أَكْلَ الْمَيْتَةِ – قَالُوا – مُعَانِدَةً لِلَّهِ وَرَسُولِهِ، وَمُجَادِلَةً بَعْضِ حُجَّةٍ وَلَا بُرْهَانٍ – أَتَأْكُلُونَ مَا قَتَلْتُمْ، وَلَا تَأْكُلُونَ مَا قَتَلَ اللَّهُ؟ يَعْنُونَ بِذَلِكَ: الْمَيْتَةَ .

وَهَذَا زَائِيٌّ فَاسِدٌ، لَا يَسْتَنِدُ عَلَى حُجَّةٍ وَلَا دَلِيلٍ بَلْ يَسْتَنِدُ إِلَى آرَائِهِمُ الْفَاسِدَةِ الَّتِي لَوْ كَانَ الْحَقُّ تَبَعًا لَهَا لَفَسَدَتِ السَّمَاوَاتُ وَالْأَرْضُ، وَمَنْ فِيهِنَّ .

فَتَبًّا لِمَنْ قَدَّمَ هَذِهِ الْعُمُولَ عَلَى شَرْعِ اللَّهِ وَأَحْكَامِهِ، الْمُوَافَقَةَ لِلْمَصَالِحِ الْعَامَّةِ وَالْمَنَافِعِ الْخَاصَّةِ. وَلَا يُسْتَعْرَبُ هَذَا مِنْهُمْ، فَإِنَّ هَذِهِ الْآرَاءَ وَأَشْبَاهَهَا، صَادِرَةٌ عَنْ وَحْيِ أَوْلِيَائِهِمْ مِنَ الشَّيَاطِينِ، الَّذِينَ يُرِيدُونَ أَنْ يُضِلُّوا الْخَلْقَ عَنْ دِينِهِمْ، وَيَدْعُوهُمْ لِيَكُونُوا مِنْ أَصْحَابِ السَّعِيرِ . وَإِنْ أَطَعْتُمُوهُمْ فِي شِرْكِهِمْ وَتَحْلِيلِهِمُ الْحَرَامَ، وَتَحْرِيمِهِمُ الْحَلَالَ إِنَّكُمْ لَمُشْرِكُونَ لِأَنَّكُمْ اتَّخَذْتُمُوهُمْ أَوْلِيَاءَ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ، وَوَأَفَقْتُمُوهُمْ عَلَى مَا بِهِ فَارَقُوا الْمُسْلِمِينَ، فَلِذَلِكَ كَانَ طَرِيقُكُمْ، طَرِيقُهُمْ .

“Verily the mushrikūn – when they heard that Allah and His Messenger forbade the self-dead, and His allowance of the slaughtered, and they used to allow the self-dead animal – they said, out of arrogance towards Allah and His Messenger (sallAllāhu alayhi wa sallam), and wanting to argue without an argument or clear proof: Do you eat what you killed yourself, and you do not eat what Allah has killed? And with this they meant: the self-dead. And this is an invalid opinion. It is not built upon and argument nor a proof. Rather is it built upon their false opinions, which if the truth was according to that, then the heavens and the earth and whoever was in them would have been destroyed. So may those perish who prefer these minds over the Law of Allah and His judgments, which are in accordance with the general advantages and the specific benefits. And it is not seen as something strange from them. Because these opinions and what is similar to them stems from the inspiration of their allies among the shayātīn; those who want to mislead the creation away from their religion, and invite them to become from the people of the blazing fire. “And if you were to obey them,” in their shirk and allowing the forbidden, and forbidding the allowed, “indeed, you would be mushrikūn.” Because you took them as allies besides Allah, and you agreed with them in that which they differed in with the Muslims, and due to this your way is (the same as) their way.”

(Tafsīr As-Sa’dī – Sūrah Al-An’ām)

These are clear words, and there exists no disagreement in this among the Muslims.

May the peace and abundant blessings be upon our Prophet Muhammad, his family and companions, and whoever follows them in goodness until the Day of Judgement.

Compiled by Abū Hājar